

EVIDENCE APPRAISAL OF A SINGLE STUDY
– DECISION ANALYSIS –

Project / Topic of your Clinical Question: _____

Reviewer: _____ **Today's Date (mm/dd/yy):** _____ **Final Evidence Level:** _____

Article Title: _____

Year: _____ **First Author:** _____ **Journal:** _____

Do the study purpose/objectives and inclusion/exclusion criteria assist in answering the clinical question?

Yes No Unknown

Comments:

A. What is the study purpose/objective? _____

B. What are the Inclusion Criteria? _____

C. What are the Exclusion Criteria? _____

** **Bolded** questions represent the key criteria for each section.*

** Lettered questions (A., B., ...) provide additional information to better answer the bolded questions.*

VALIDITY: ARE THE STUDY RESULTS VALID OR CREDIBLE? IS THE DECISION ANALYSIS USABLE?

1. Were all the important strategies and outcomes included and clearly specified? Yes No Unknown

Comments:

2. Were all of the realistic clinical strategies compared? Yes No Unknown

Comments:

3. Were all clinically relevant outcomes considered? Yes No Unknown

Comments:

4. Was an explicit and sensible process used to identify, select, and combine evidence into probabilities? Yes No Unknown

Comments:

5. Were the utilities obtained in an explicit and sensible way from credible sources? Yes No Unknown

Comments:

6. Was the potential impact of any uncertainty in the evidence determined? Yes No Unknown

Comments:

7. Was there freedom from conflict of interest? Yes No Unknown

Comments:

A. Was there freedom from conflict of interest in the sponsor/funding agency? Yes No Unknown

Comments:

B. Was there freedom from conflict of interest in the investigators? Yes No Unknown

Comments:

EVIDENCE APPRAISAL OF A SINGLE STUDY
– DECISION ANALYSIS –

RELIABILITY: ARE THESE VALID ANALYSIS RESULTS IMPORTANT?

- 8. In the baseline analysis, does one strategy result in a clinically important gain for patients?** Yes No Unknown
If No, is the result a toss-up? Yes No
Comments:
- 9. Could uncertainty in the evidence change the result?** Yes No Unknown
Comments:
-
-

**APPLICABILITY: CAN I APPLY THESE VALID, IMPORTANT STUDY RESULTS TO TREATING MY PATIENTS?
WILL THE RESULTS HELP ME WITH MY PATIENT?**

- 10. Can the results be applied to my population of interest?** Yes No Unknown
Comments:
- A. Do the probabilities apply to my patient's clinical characteristics?** Yes No Unknown
Comments:
- B. Is the intervention feasible in my care setting?** Yes No Unknown
Comments:
- C. Were all patient important outcomes considered? (Are substitute endpoints valid?)** Yes No Unknown
Comments:
- D. Are the likely benefits worth the potential harm and costs?** Yes No Unknown
Comments:
- 11. Are your patient's values and preferences satisfied by the analysis?** Yes No Unknown
Comments:
- A. Do the utilities reflect those of my patient?** Yes No Unknown
Comments:
- B. Were the patients in this study similar to my population of interest?** Yes No Unknown
Comments:
- C. Do your patient and you have a clear assessment of their values and preferences?** Yes No Unknown
Comments:
- D. Are they met by this analysis?** Yes No Unknown
Comments:
- 12. Would you include this analysis in development of a recommendation?** Yes No Unknown
Comments:
-
-

Additional Comments or Notes: _____

EVIDENCE APPRAISAL OF A SINGLE STUDY
– DECISION ANALYSIS –

* Consider each "No" answer and the degree to which this limitation is a threat to the validity of the results, then check the appropriate box to assign the level of quality for this study/article.

- THE EVIDENCE LEVEL IS:** **Good Quality Decision Analysis** (1a)
 Lesser Quality Decision Analysis (1b)
 Not Valid, Reliable, or Applicable

TABLE OF EVIDENCE LEVELS				
DOMAIN OF CLINICAL QUESTION	TYPE OF STUDY / STUDY DESIGN			
	RCT⁺ / CCT⁺	Cohort – Prospective	Economic Analysis Decision Analysis	Expert Opinion Case Reports
Cost Analysis	<i>2a</i>	<i>3a</i>	1a	5
Decision Analysis	<i>2b</i>	<i>3b</i>	1b	

⁺ *RCT* = Randomized Controlled Trial

⁺ *CCT* = Controlled Clinical Trial

Development for this appraisal form is based on:

1. Guyatt, G.; Rennie, D.; Evidence-Based Medicine Working Group.; and American Medical Association.: Users' guides to the medical literature : a manual for evidence-based clinical practice. *Users' guides to the medical literature : a manual for evidence-based clinical practice*: "JAMA & archives journals." Chicago, IL, 2002
2. Melnyk, B. M. and E. Fineout-Overholt (2005). Evidence-based practice in nursing & healthcare : a guide to best practice. Philadelphia, Lippincott Williams & Wilkins.
3. Phillips, et al: Oxford Centre for Evidence-based Medicine Levels of Evidence, 2001. Last accessed Nov 14, 2007 from <http://www.cebm.net/index.aspx?o=1025>.
4. Fineout-Overholt and Johnston: Teaching EBP: asking searchable, answerable clinical questions. *Worldviews Evid Based Nurs*, 2(3): 157-60, 2005.